THE VALUE RELEVANCE OF FINANCIAL INFORMATION IN TROUBLED WATERS. THE EVIDENCE OF ITALIAN CONTEXT

Alessandro Giosi*, Silvia Testarmata**, Ignazio Buscema***

Abstract

Stemming from value relevance research, this study investigates the ability of accounting and financial data to provide useful information about the economic value of the firm in trouble waters. Because the firm is at the center of a network of interests of many stakeholders, that put some expectations on it, the investors requires useful financial statements information in order to take rational investment decisions about financial instruments, such as equity and corporate debts. Academic literature define value relevant the accounting information able to change the expectations but also to induce a change in the behavior of the decision makers. To ensure that the accounting information reported in the financial statements are value relevant they need to be related to the company current value. The aim of this research is to study the usefulness of accounting information perceived by investors and to understand the process of allocation of resources in the capital market in trouble waters.

Keywords: Financial Information, Accounting, Stakeholders, Capital Market

*University of Rome 'Tor Vergata', Via Columbia 2, 00133, Rome, Italy

Tel: +39 06 72595835

Fax: +39 06 72595804

Email: giosi@uniroma2.it

**University of Rome 'Tor Vergata', Via Columbia 2, 00133, Rome, Italy

Tel: +39 06 72595807 Fax: +39 06 72595804

Email: testarmata@economia.uniroma2.it

***University of Rome 'Tor Vergata', Via Columbia 2, 00133, Rome, Italy

Tel: +39 06 72595751 Fax: +39 06 72595804

Email: ignaziobuscema@yahoo.it

1 Literature review

Value Relevance studies belong to the broader field called Capital-Market-Based Accounting (CMBAR), that start with the pioneering studies dating back to the 60s of Ball and Brown (1968) and Beaver (1968).

According to the clearly established academic literature, the value relevance analysis is purely focused on the link between accounting values and stock market prices. The value relevance studies are based on the assumption of capital market efficiency, that is the capacity of capital market to react to the new information on the company financial performance. In Beaver opinion (1968), the value relevance is the explication power of accounting data in accordance with the specifications in the stock price, while in Hellstrom one (2005), it is the peculiar ability of the financial statements to capture or summarize information about the value of equity securities. As a consequence, the degree of association between financial information and equity market value could be interpreted as an indicator of the relevance of

financial statements information on the formation of the company's market value.

According to Ball and Brown (1968), the utility of net income must be assessed by examining the information content. Their analysis considers the net income as relevant information and suggests using its relationship with stock returns as a predictive criterion of its information's utility. A change in market value associated with a new communication of net income as index of financial information would provide evidence of its utility.

Beaver (1968) focused on information relevance of net income at the moment of announcement of the financial statements. The aim of the analysis was to measure empirically the perception of investors in informative value at announcement of financial results. Beaver found the empirical evidence about the increase obtained from both the trading volume and the volatility of earnings. Beaver concluded that net income was "relevant value": the announcement of the financial results affected the trend of both, the volume and the price of the ordinary shares in the week after publication.

However, recent empirical studies suggest deterioration in the ability of the profits to be value relevant, as pointed out by Collins, Maydew and Weiss (1997), and by Levers and Zarowin (1999). The literature debate was born in order to explain the loss of value relevance over time. Collins et al. (1997) identify numerous external factors that may have contributed to the change of the estimation power of value relevance. In particular, they refer to the companies increase in the technology and services field that resulted in an increase of its intangible assets, present in the firm and not accounted for in their financial statements; the lower persistence of earnings due to special components; the increase in the number of losses reported by companies which may result in a decreased ability of earnings to predict future returns (Hayn, 1995).

In summary, the literature does not agree on the value relevance of earnings, arriving to conflicting empirical results. The debate refers to the inability of net income to report a significantly stable relationship with market prices and return in the long run and to present similar significance of the correlations tested in different countries on the same variables. Despite net income determines an impacts on financial market at the moment of announcement, this information does not seem to generically useful to explain the company's value over time. This possibility can be considered only by recognizing a continuous misalignment between accounting data and market data, as a logical consequence of the presence of accounting policies inspired by conservatism, and even not neglecting any specific legal accounting characteristics of each country.

Stemming from this controversial debate, our analysis aims at verifying and assessing how and how financial performance affects performance of listed companies during the financial crisis through the empirical analysis of the Italian listed companies, with the reference to the industrial sector. In particular, we investigate if the financial crisis has revealed additional and alternative (other than those already found in the literature) financial factors that can explain the listed companies shares value in the case of Italian listed companies. We expected that the financial crisis has determined a change in the investment behavior of stakeholders, changing their time horizon of interest. In according of this expectation, we formulate the following hypothesis for the Italian listed companies:

H1: In the financial statements of industrial companies the value relevance of net income is higher than that of book value per share (Ohlson model)

H2: In the financial statements of industrial companies the value relevance of short time variables, as dividend yield is higher than that of long time variables, as leverage (our model)

Our model aims to reconstruct the evolution of the average market price on the basis of the identification of endogenous variables: the objective of the study is to verify whether these variables are able to assess the impact of corporate financial performance's trend on the share price's trend. In addition, the correlation analysis between the market price and the company's financial performance has been enhanced by the introduction of exogenous variables that can explain the financial crisis' impact on the changes in the share price and, as a consequence, on the financial performance of the companies. We compared the trend of the single company performance with the performance of their specific sectors, which by definition are affected by the recessive crisis.

2 Data sample and data collection

To build a consistent model, we considered the Italian companies listed on the Milan Stock Exchange, excluding banks and financial institutions, over the period between 2006 and 2011. The choice of the period 2006-2011 allow us to compare the value relevance of accounting data before and after the financial crisis and to evaluate the crisis effect on the relevance of accounting information to determine the share market price. We expect that the empirical research shows a change in the investment behavior of stakeholders and therefore in their decisions regarding the allocation of capital resource.

The sample of Italian listed companies has been calculated by excluding banks and financial institutions. The exclusion is justified by the fact that these companies are subject to a specific accounting discipline in their financial statements, with different shape, structure and content because of their peculiar activity. The population is made up of 174 companies classified as follows: 26 in the FTSE MIB, FTSE MID CAP in 45, 102 in the FTSE SMALL CAP. Under the new structure of the MTA, it is also considered the FTSE STAR segment, which includes 58 companies.

The financial information of Italian listed companies were obtained by creating a database in an excel spreadsheet, using sources such as the website of the Italian Stock Exchange, the Consob and the financial statements and management reports of each companies. Using our database we elaborate the financial information regarding income statement, balance sheet and cash flow statement and calculate a series of financial indices aimed at making a judgment on the financial performance of the companies.

3 Research Methods

In order to estimate the accounting information significance, the study uses a multiple regression model proposed by Ohlson (1995) and Lev and Zarowin (1999). Its reliability is evaluated by a coefficient of determination R2, that expresses numerically how much variance of the independent variable is explained by the dependent variables selected in the model. In other words, the value of R2

represents the measure of value relevance. The objective of the model is to define a relationship between the market value of equity and the accounting information:

$$MVE = f(AI)$$
 (1)

The function analyzes the relationship between the available accounting information and the market value or, in other words, how much of the accounting information itself explains the change in market value over a specified period.

The first regression statistical analysis is structured according to the price model: the equation translates the evaluation model of Ohlson (1995):

$$P_{i(t+1)} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 BV S_{it} + \beta_2 EP S_{it} + \varepsilon_{it}$$
 (2)

The estimation of the parameters of the ARIMA model and of the regression coefficients was conducted by the method of maximum likelihood, that compared to the OLS (Ordinary Least Square) model is more suitable to highlight significant serial correlations even if measured in very distant periods. Once the model was built and the estimation of the independent variables coefficients and the standard error was calculated, it was decided to verify the goodness of the fit of the model to the data through the standard error and the coefficient of determination. In order to neutralize the effect due to the different number of explanatory variables, it is use the coefficient of multiple determinations correctly:

$$R_c^2 = 1 - \frac{SSE/(n-k-1)}{SST/(n-1)}$$
 (3)

where SSE = Sum of Square Errors, SST = Sum of Square Total.

To verify the significance, we use a statistical test. Based on the observed sample, the statistical test aims to verify whether or not to accept the null hypothesis: if the information obtained from the sample is in stark contrast with the null hypothesis is rejected. The level of significance for which accept or reject the null hypothesis is a = 0.10. In order to remove arbitrariness of the choice of a, we resorted to p-value, which allowed a greater awareness of the degree of evidence obtained by the rejection of the null hypothesis. By linear regression, first we determine the significance of the entire model and then that of the individual variables. The two variables suitable for the purpose are, respectively, the F-test and t-test. In order to control the level of correlation between the explanatory variables (multi-collinearity), we resorted to the VIF (Variance Inflaction Factor):

$$VIF_j = \frac{1}{1 - R_j^2} \tag{4}$$

To build a second multiple linear regression model, we used EPS (Earning per Share) for the variables income, ROA (Return on Assets) and DY (Dividend yield) for ones return, the Leverage for ones assets and NCFinv (Net Cash Flow per investment) for ones flow. The multiple regression model is represented as follows:

$$P_{i(t+1)} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 EPS_{it} + \beta_2 ROA_{it} + \beta_3 DY_{it} + \beta_4 LEVERAGE_{It} + \beta_5 NCFinv_{it} + \varepsilon_{it}$$
 (5)

4 Results

As regard to the first regression model, we verified all the hypotheses of significance, arbitrariness and multicollinearity. The estimated coefficients for the regression model in 2006 show that the market value is affect more by earnings per share then book value per share. From 2007, regression coefficient's values are lower than the previous year and the trend continued in 2008, when the reduction was more significant in absolute terms, however. In 2009 there is a further drop in the share price and a further decrease in profits. Coefficients analysis shows a dependence of the price compared to book value substantially more stable compared to 2008, while we note a significant increase in the influence of EPS.

Relative to the second regression model, the regression coefficients show that in 2006 the significance of EPS (in accordance with the previous model), ROA and NCFinv. ROA, however, reaches a larger absolute value. In 2008 2007e significant result the EPS and DY, which has a negative coefficient. In

2009 there were still significant as EPS and DY, which has on the contrary a positive value.

6. Discussion and conclusion

As regard to the first regression model, we can observe that the investment decisions until the explosion of the 2008 financial crisis were more influenced by net income rather than the balance sheet solidity. The price collapse caused by the financial crisis has also led to a reduction in the coefficient of determination and a greater focus by investors on companies with the best ability to overcome the situation.

In 2006 it is interesting to note that the cash flows for investment exhibit an inverse relationship with the price: increased investment spending corresponds to a higher stock price, while divestments have a negative influence on the market price. By results obtained, we disclose a predominant orientation to long-term investors for 2006. This interpretation seems to be confirmed in 2007 and 2008, in which investors are oriented reward companies that keep their internal resources produced.

In 2009, investors do not look for future capacity to generate income but they are instead interested in immediate results. From the empirical analysis appears clear an interesting change in the time horizon of the investment from the medium – long term to the short term.

References

- Aboody, D., Barth, M., Kasznick, R., (2004), "SFAS no. 123 Stock-Based Compensation Expense and Equity Market Values", The Accounting Review, 2: 251-275.
- Akbar, S. (2007), "The Separate Valuation Relevance of Earnings, Book Value and their Components in Profit and Loss Making Firms: UK Evidence", Working paper series.
- Amir, E., Harris, T.S. e Venuti, E.K. (1993), "A comparison of the value relevance of U.S. versus non-U.S. GAPP accounting measures using from 20-F reconciliations; Journal of Accounting Research, Vol 31, n.3.
- 4. Amir, E., Livne,G. (2005), "Accounting, Valuation and Duration of Football Player Contracts", Journal of Business Finance and Accounting, 3-4: 549-586.
- 5. Anandarajan, A., Iftekhar, H. (2010), "Value relevance of earnings: Evidence from Middle Eastern and North African Countries", Advances in Accounting, 2: 270- 279.
- Avallone, F.G. (2008), "L'impatto dell'informativa contabile di tipo volontario sui mercati finanziari", Giappichelli, Torino.
- Azzali, S., Fornaciari, L., Pesci, C. (2012), "Reddito d'impresa e Value Relevance per gli investitori", Business and Management Sciences International QuartelyReview, 1: 1-19.
- 8. Bae, K.H., Jeong, S.W. (2007), "The Value-relevance of Earnings and Book Value, Ownership Structure, and Business Group Affiliation: Evidence From Koreanm Business Groups", Journal of Business Finance and Accounting, 5-6: 740-766.
- 9. Ball, R., Brown, P., (1968) "An Empirical Evaluation of Accounting Income Numbers", Journal of Research, 6: 159-78.
- Banghøj, J., Plenborg, T. (2008), "Value relevance of voluntary disclosure in the annual report", Accounting and Finance, 2: 159-180.
- 11. Barth, M., Landsman, W.R., Lang, M.H., (2008), "International Accounting Standards and Accounting Quality", Journal of Accounting Review, 3.
- Barth, M.E., Beaver, W.J., Hand, R.M., Landsman, W.R. (2004), "Accruals, Accounting-Based Valuation Models, and the Prediction of Equity Values", Accounting and Finance.
- Barth, M.E., Beaver W.H., Landsman W.R., (2001), "The relevance of the value relevance literature for financial accounting standard setting: another view", Journal of Accounting and Economics, 31.
- Beisland, L.A. (2011), "The value relevance of losses revisited: the importance of earnings aggregation", Global Business and Economics Review, 2.
- Beisland, L.A., Knivsflà, K.H. (2012), "Have IFRS Changed How Stock Prices Associate with Earnings and Book Values? Evidence from Norway", Working papers series.

- 16. Beaver, W.H. (1968), "The value relevance of annual earnings announcements", Journal of Accounting Research, (supplement 1968).
- Bozzolan, et al. (2009), "Forward-Looking Disclosures, Financial Verifiability and Analysts' Forecasts: A Study of Cross-Listed European Firms", European Accounting Review, 3.
- Callaò, S., Jarne, J.I., Lainèz, J.A. (2007)," Adoption of IFRS in Spain: Effect on the comparability and relevance of financial reporting", Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation, 16: 148–178.
- Callen, J.L., Livnat, J., Segal, D. (2006), "The Information Content of SEC Filings and Information Environment: A Variance Decomposition Analysis, The Accounting Review, 5: 1017-1043.
- Collins., D.W., Maydew, E.L. and Weiss, I.S. (1997)
 "Change in the Value Relevance of Earnings and
 Book Value over the Past Forty Years", Journal of
 Accounting and Economics, 24: 39-67;
- 21. Caramiello, C., Di Lazzaro, F., Fiori, G. (2003), "Indici di bilancio", Giuffrè, Milano.
- Cardamone, P., Carnevale, C., Giunta F. (2009), "Social Report and Stock Price. An empirical analysis", Economia Aziendale Online, 1:1-16.
- 23. Carnevale, C., Mazzuca, M., Venturini, S. (2010), "La value relevance del bilancio sociale: il caso delle banche europee", Working paper series. Carretta, A., Mattarocci, G. (2012), "Financial Systems in Troubled Waters", Routledge, Oxon.
- 24. Cavalieri, E., Cavalieri, M., Fazzari, A.L., Ferraris Franceschi, R., Lucianelli, G. (2010), "Economia aziendale", Giappichelli Editore, Torino.
- Cayrol, M.L., Lopez, T.J., Rees, L.L. (2007), "Is the Value Relevance of Earnings Conditional on the Timing of Earnings Information?", Journal of Accounting and Public Policy, 1: 62-95.
- Chalmers, K., Clinch, G., Godfrey, J.M. (2010), "Changes in Value Relevance of Financial Information Upon IFRS Adoption: Evidence from Australia", Australian Journal of Management, 2: 151-173.
- Che, B. (2007), "Value-relevance of accounting information and shareholding structure in emerging capital markets: evidence from Chinese listed companies", Working paper series.
- 28. Choi, W. (2007), "Bank Relationships and the Value Relevance of the Income Statement: Evidence from Income-Statement Conservatism", Journal of Business Finance and Accounting, 7-8: 1051–1072.
- Clarkson, P., Douglas, J., Gordon, H.,Richardson, D.,Thompson, R., (2011), "The impact of IFRS adoption on the value relevance of book value and earnings", Journal of ContemporanyAaccounting and Economics, 1: 1-17.
- Cordazzo, M. (2007), "L'impatto borsistico dell'informativa sugli intangibili", Franco Angeli, Milano.
- 31. Cormier, Antunes-Lapointe, D., (2009), "First-time adoption of IFRS, managerial incentives, and value relevance: some French evidence", Journal of International Accounting Research, 2: 1-42.
- 32. Cormier, D., Magnan, M. (2007), "The revisited contribution of environmental reporting to investors' valuation of a firm's earnings: An international perspective", Ecological Economics, 3-4: 613-626.

- Corteau, L. (2008), "Valori d'impresa e valori di bilancio - Modelli di valutazione per gli investitori azionari -", Franco Angeli, Milano.
- 34. Covrig, V., Low, S. (2005), "The Relevance of Analysts' Earnings Forecasts in Japan", Journal of Business Finance and Accounting, 7-8: 1437-1463.
- 35. Dahmash, F.N.H., Durand, R.B., Watson, J. (2009), "The value relevance and reliability of reported goodwill and identifiable intangible assets", The British Accounting Review, 2: 120-137.
- Darrough, M.N., Ye, J. (2006), "Valuation of Loss Firms in a Knowledge-Based Economy", Review of Accounting Studies, 1.
- Dastgir, M., Sajadi, H.S., Akhgar, O.M. (2010), "The association between components of income statement, components of cash low statement and stock returns", Business Intelligence Journal, 1: 9-21.
- 38. Devalle, A. (2010), "Misurazione della performance nel bilancio IFRS", Pearson Italia, Milano, Torino.
- Devalle, A., Onali, E., Magarini, R., (2010), "Assessing the Value Relevance of Accounting Data After the Introduction of IFRS in Europe", Journal of Financial Management and Accounting, 2: 86-119.
- Francis, J. e Schipper, K. (1999), "Have Financial Statements Lost Their Relevance?", Journal of Accounting Research, vol 37, n.2.
- 41. Giosi, A., Di Carlo, E. e Staglianò, B. (2012) "Discussing the value relevance of earnings and book value: evidence from the Italian context" in Carretta, A. e Mattarocci, G. (a cura di), Financial Systems in Troubled Waters, Routledge, Oxon, pp. 262-276.
- 42. Gyerde, O., Knivsfla, K., Saettem, F. (2008), "The Value-Relevance of Adopting IFRS: Evidence from 145 NGAAP Restatements", Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation, 2: 92-112.
- 43. Guatri, L. (1991), "La teoria di creazione del valore. Una via Europea", Egea, Milano, p.6.
 44. Guatri, L., Bini, M. (2005), "Nuovo trattato sulla
- 44. Guatri, L., Bini, M. (2005), "Nuovo trattato sulla valutazione delle aziende", Univ. Bocconi Editore, Milano.
- Hadi, M.M., (2006), "The Value-Relevance of Income Levels and Components Reported", International Research Journal of Finance and Economics, 4: 133-142.
- Hayn, C. (1995), "The Information Content of Losses", Journal of Accouting and Economics, 20: 125-153
- 47. Hassel, L., Nilsson, H., Nyquist, S., (2005), "The value relevance of environmental performance", European Accounting Review, 1: 41-61.
- Heibatollah, S., Haiyan, Z. (2004) "A comparison of value relevance of accounting information in different segments of the Chinese stock market", The International Journal of Accounting, 4: 403-427.
- 49. Holtausen, R.W., Watts, R.L., 2001, "The relevance of the value relevance literature for financial accounting standard setting", Journal of Accounting and Economics, 31, pp. 3-75.
- Hung, M., Subramanyam K. (2007), "Financial statement effects of adopting international accounting standards: the case of Germany", Review of accounting Studies, 4: 1-48.
- 51. Iatridis, G., (2010), "International Financial Reporting Standards and the quality of financial statement information", International Review of Financial Analysis, 3: 193-204.

- 52. Ilaria, P., (2012), "La qualità del'attività di Investor Relator: un'analisi delle società italiane quotate in Borsa, Università Cà Foscari, Venezia.
- Jenkins, D. S., Kane, G.D., Velury, U. (2009), "Earnings Conservatism and Value Relevance Across the Business Cycle", Journal of Business Finance and Accounting, 10: 1041-1058.
- Jung, B., Shane, P.B., Yang, Y.S. (2008), "The Existence and Value-Relevance of Financial Analysts' Long-Term Growth Forecasts", Working paper series.
- 55. Karamanou, I. (2011), "Value relevance of analyst earnings forecasts in emerging markets", Advances in Accounting, 1: 128-137.
- 56. Keener, M.H. (2011), "The relative value relevance of earnings and book value across industries", Journal of Finance and Accounting.
- 57. Khurana, K., Kim, M.S. (2003), "Relative value relevance of historical cost vs. fair value: Evidence from bank holding companies", Journal of Accounting and Public Policy, 1.
- 58. Kimberly, F., (2002), "The effect of growth on the value relevance of accounting data", Journal of Business Research, 1.
- Kwon, G.K. (2009), "The Value Relevance of Book Values, Earnings and Cash flows: Evidence from South Korea", International Journal of Business and Management, 10: 28-42.
- 60. Landsman, W.R. et al. (2003), "Accounting Valuation: is earning quality an issue?", Financial Analysts Journal.6.
- 61. Lev, B., Nissi, D., Thomas, J. (2005), "On the informational usefulness of R&D capitalization and amortization", Working paper series
- 62. Lev, B., Zarowin, P. (1999) "The Boundaries of Financial Reporting and How to Extend Them", Journal of Accounting Research, 4: 353-385.
- Lin, Z.J., Chen, F., (2005), "Value relevance of international accounting standards harmonization: Evidence from A- and B-share markets in China", Journal of International Accounting, Auditing and Taxation, 2 79–103.
- 64. Marquardt, C.A., Wiedman, C.L., (2004), "The Effect of Earnings Management on the Value Relevance of Accounting Information", Journal of Business Finance and Accounting, 3-4: 297-342.
- Masako, N., Darrough, J.Ye. (2006), "Valuation of Loss Firms in a Knowledge- Based Economy", Review of accounting Studies, 1: 1-51.
- Mason, L., (2004), "The Impact of Accounting Conservatism on the Magnitude of the Differential Information Content of Cash Flows and Accruals", Journal of Accounting, Auditing & Finance, 3: 250-282
- 67. Muller, V.O. (2011), "Value Relevance of Consolidated Versus Parent Company Financial Statements: Evidence from the Largest Three European Capital Markets", Accounting and Management Information Systems, 3: 326-350.
- 68. Ohlson, J.A. (1995) "Earnings, book values and dividends in equity valuation", Contemporary Accounting Research, 11:661-87
- 69. Ou, J. A., Sepe, J.F. (2002), "Analysts Earnings Forecasts and the Roles of Earnings and Book Value in Equity Valuation", Journal of Business Finance and Accounting, 3-4: 287-316.
- 70. Paglietti, P. (2009), "Earnings management, timely loss recognition and value relevance in Europe

- following the IFRS mandatory adoption: evidence from Italian listed companies", Business and Management Sciences International Quartely Review, 4: 97-117.
- 71. Paquita, Y., Friday, D., Eng, L.L., Liu, C.S. (2006), "The effects of the Asian crisis, corporate governance and accounting system on the valuation of book value and earnings", The International Journal of Accounting, 1: 22-40.
- 72. Penman, S.H., Zhang, X.J. (2002), "Accounting Conservatism, the Quality of Earnings, and Stock Returns", The Accounting Review, 2: 1-38.
- Rajgopal et al. (2003), "The value Relevance of Network Advantages", Journal of Accounting Review,
- 74. Sinkin, C., Wright, C.J., Burnett, R.D. (2008), "Ecoefficiency and firm value" Journal of Accounting and Public Policy, 2: 167-176.

- Sòstero, U., Ferrarese, P., (200), "Analisi di bilancio", Giuffrè, Milano.
- 76. Stephen, L., Casta, R., Jean-François, O. (2012), "Value Relevance of Summary Accounting Income Measures: Evidence from Major European Capital Markets", Working paper series.
- Tsalavoutas, I., Evans, L. (2009), "Transition to IFRS and value relevance in a small but developed market: A look at Greek evidence", Working papers series.
- 78. Tsoligkas, F., et al. (2011), "Value relevance of R&D in the UK after IFRS mandatory implementation", Applied Financial Economics, 3: 957–967.
- Xu, L., Cai, F. (2006), "Value relevance of revenue and revenue growth", Working paper series.
- 80. Xu, W., Anandarajan, A., Curatola, A. (2011), "The value relevance of goodwill impairment", Research in Accounting Regulation, 2: 145-148.