

INTEGRATION OF STRATEGIC PLANNING AND AIR CONNECTIVITY IN TOURISM DEVELOPMENT

Nanang Suparman ^{*}, Abdal ^{**}, Asep Hidayat ^{**},
Adang Djatnika Effendi ^{**}, Muhammad Andi Septiadi ^{**}

^{*} Corresponding author, UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Bandung, Indonesia
Contact details: UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, 40614 Bandung, Indonesia
^{**} UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Bandung, Indonesia



Abstract

How to cite this paper: Suparman, N., Abdal, Hidayat, A., Effendi, A. D., & Septiadi, M. A. (2023). Integration of strategic planning and air connectivity in tourism development. *Corporate & Business Strategy Review*, 4(2), 184–196.
<https://doi.org/10.22495/cbsrv4i2art17>

Copyright © 2023 The Authors

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0).
<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

ISSN Online: 2708-4965
ISSN Print: 2708-9924

Received: 13.10.2022
Accepted: 28.04.2023

JEL Classification: O2, O21, D04, E61, L93
DOI: 10.22495/cbsrv4i2art17

The problem of the paper focused on the role of the integration of strategic planning for tourism development and air transport connectivity is integral to advancing Indonesia's tourist destinations with world-class marine park attractions spread across several eastern provinces that have not been visited by tourists optimally. They were relying on opening flight paths connected to the main entrances to Jakarta and Bali airports. This research aims to uncover and analyze the strategic planning of tourism development in Sulawesi Utara Province. A mixed method was used in research that adopted the model of Golkar (2005) with 96 questionnaires to officials of the tourism office, airport authorities, and airlines. An analysis using a four-dimensional SWOT (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats) analysis (Mercer, 1991). The findings show that the accessibility of air transportation for tourist visits is limited and is not integrated with the flight paths of tourists. Tourism development planning in Sulawesi Utara Province tends to be partial and not consider critical variables. Such as the development of air transport infrastructure to open access to tourist destinations that are difficult to reach by land and sea transportation. Contribution to the theory and managerial implications are discussed, and suggestions for further research are given.

Keywords: Strategic Planning, Air Connectivity, Tourist Destination, Indonesia

Authors' individual contribution: Conceptualization — N.S.; Methodology — N.S.; Validation — A.H.; Formal Analysis — N.S. and A.; Investigation — A.D.E. and M.A.S.; Writing — Original Draft — N.S.; Writing — Review & Editing — A.D.E. and A.H.; Visualization — M.A.S.

Declaration of conflicting interests: The Authors declare that there is no conflict of interest.

1. INTRODUCTION

The development of the tourism sector in Indonesia continues to be improved and expanded. This is in line with the current trend of high growth rates in the tourism sector, which are diverted to countries

in East Asia and Southeast Asia region, including Indonesia (Andraz et al., 2015). Thus, Indonesia's tourism prospects are bright and promising. The government is optimistic that tourism will become the largest foreign exchange earner after oil and gas, supported by exotic and diverse natural

scenery. Meanwhile, potential tourism objects are still being developed by allocating a budget for funding infrastructure development which has been a significant obstacle (Smith et al., 2016).

President Joko Widodo and the Ministry of Tourism target 3,600,000 foreign tourists and 550,000 local tourist visits in 2022 after the COVID-19 pandemic ends and the normal situation returns (Biro Pusat Statistik [BPS], 2022). Effective strategic planning in tourism COVID-19 crisis management aims to overcome adverse effects (Al-Janabi et al., 2023). Tourism has a positive impact on regional economic growth (Anwar, 2019). In the Indonesian context, it is proven that the regional income of many provinces or regencies is obtained from the arrival of foreign tourists and domestic tourists. Bali will continue to be maintained as Indonesia's leading tourist destination and a model for developing New Bali tourist destinations, one of which is Sulawesi Utara (Tunggono, 2016). Priority tourist destinations are supported by infrastructure development to increase connectivity between tourist destinations with one (Ollivaud & Haxton, 2019).

As one of the main entry points for tourism in Eastern Indonesia, Sulawesi Utara is now designated as one of the leading destinations. Tourism movement is indicated by various events in the Ministry of Tourism's calendar of events (CoE) category. Such as the Tomohon International Flower Festival (TIFF), the flower parade in Pasadena, United States, the Bunaken Festival, and the Lembah Strait Festival (Kambey, 2016). The Manado Fiesta is also an event that many tourists are waiting for. Since 2007, the Central Government, through the Ministry of Culture and Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia, has designated Sulawesi Utara as one of the 10 leading tourism destination provinces and one of the 10 MICE (meeting, incentive, convention, and exhibition) destinations in Indonesia.

Tourism creates entire industries that are aimed at providing the wants and needs of tourists. Many people and cities exist in a certain area primarily due to tourism (Abuamoud et al., 2022). The occurrence of positive visits by foreign tourists and the tourism potential of Sulawesi Utara has prompted some domestic and regional airlines to design direct flight services and direct flights to Manado. Wings Air opened its first Morotai-Manado flight in 2018, and then Garuda Indonesia planned to conduct its first Manado-Davao Philippines flight in 2019. Also, several flight routes to Manado will be opened soon between 2019 and 2020. This is reasonable because air connectivity is a key driver for tourism development, accommodating the higher shares in terms of international tourist arrivals (ITA) (Dwyer & Forsyth, 2008). Moreover, the geographical condition of Sulawesi Utara is an archipelago with difficult and long routes to reach tourist destinations, so developing air transportation routes is the right choice.

Meanwhile, the world's aviation market is growing dynamically in Asia and the Middle East. Certainly, it impacts the tourist attractiveness of these regions, and the route map is getting bigger (Zajac, 2016). Airline companies in Indonesia are persistently marketing short and medium-haul flights at low fares that are affordable for tourists. The integration of air transport connectivity as the carrying capacity of tourism infrastructure,

with strategic planning for tourism development as a superstructure instrument, is expected to promote tourism progress comprehensively.

Previous studies on strategic planning and transport connectivity have addressed several issues, including these strategic planning in a turbulent environment (Camillus & Datta, 1991), their role in handling market failure (Choy, 1991), the integration concept (Bourgeois, 1980), and the government's role in strategic planning (Bryson & Roering, 1987). A comprehensive study of the strategic integration planning and air transport connectivity in tourism destinations is still limited. Therefore, the study aims to reveal deeper insights and new things in tourism destination development by integrating planning and low-cost air transportation modes in Sulawesi Utara Province, which has been designated as a New Bali tourist destination. The research findings are expected to help change the paradigm of local government tourism planning in Indonesia which separates or excludes transportation mode development variables in strategic tourism planning (Gandara, 2020). Based on the consideration above, we state two research questions:

RQ1: How to plan a tourism development strategy in Sulawesi Utara?

RQ2: How the air transport connectivity able to boost tourist visits?

This paper is structured as follows. Section 1 presents the introduction and argument for the study. The review of the relevant literature and hypotheses development are provided in Section 2. Meanwhile, the methodology to guide this research is presented in Section 3. Sections 4 and 5 present results and discussion, particularly the integration of strategic tourism planning and air transport connectivity. Section 6 concludes this paper with some limitations and recommendations for further research on strategic tourism planning.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

The strategy is the basic pattern of present and planned objectives. The success of each strategy includes its capacity to achieve specific objectives in a coherent framework that reflects the area's development potential (Popescu & Corboş, 2011). Development and promotion of tourism without a guiding framework and pre-defined strategies for achieving development objectives are not feasible (Hall, 2011). The combination of these objectives and measures cannot happen by chance or as a collection of decisions by the public and private sectors to ensure future destinations have a clear vision. It should be positioned, qualified, and promoted. This requires accurate and comprehensive process-oriented strategic planning, which is important for the sustainable development of tourism, whether at the national, regional, or local levels (Ladeiras et al., 2010).

Adopting strategic planning for tourism development is essential because it often takes a long time to mitigate the effects of control of the development process after observing tourism and the appearance of unwanted social and environmental effects. Strategic planning implies establishing long-term conformity between organizational objectives and changing market opportunities. All practices and activities regarding tourism must be based on a strategic plan

(Asadi, 2011). According to Mercer (1991), strategic planning must have the following principles:

- 1) environmental scanning;
- 2) determining the mission of the organization;
- 3) determination of strategy;
- 4) targeting.

Several studies have been conducted on strategic planning and tourism development in national parks as tourist destinations, ecotourism destinations, natural tourism and cities around the world, such as the national park in Finland (Puhakka & Saarinen, 2013), national park Skadar Lake in Montenegro (Bulatović & Tripković-Marković, 2015), Baluran National Park in Indonesia (Nugroho et al., 2018), and Pancar Mountain in Indonesia (Pambudi et al., 2014).

2.1. The tourism development strategic planning

A strategic planning model can function as a guideline and road map in a large narrative of regional tourism development projections for related parties, covering all aspects of planning, environment, values, and resources in development planning. An important part of strategic management is strategic planning, which, according to Bryson (2018), is an innovation in public services. This is because even in public organizations, strategic planning can be used and helps the organization achieve its goals effectively.

Strategic planning is a guide to directing a public organization to achieve the goals that have been set (Sarfaraz et al., 2013). Strategic planning is one way of making a road map that is clear and easy to understand by related parties such as the government community and immigrants. Thus, the importance of strategic planning as an instrument for tourism development in Sulawesi Utara Province. Its preparation must pay attention to planning standards at a smaller scale for international, national, local, and regional development because tourism is a sector that is integrated with other development sectors. Strategic planning is a result-oriented process to be achieved. Orientation for 1 (one) year to 5 (five) years, systematically and continuously. This planning takes into account existing or potentials, opportunities, and constraints.

Strategic planning for tourism development in Sulawesi Utara Province is analyzed sequentially, covering 4 (four) elements: environmental scanning, organizational mission determination, strategy determination, and target determination. The SWOT (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats) analysis model introduced by Mercer (1991) aims to map the problem conditions and tourism business opportunities. With SWOT analysis, decision-makers can take appropriate and measurable steps related to tourism development in Sulawesi Utara as one of the main entrances and tourist destinations in Indonesia.

H1: The strategic planning analysis has an important role in tourism development.

2.2. The air transport connectivity to boost tourist visits

The Central Government in the last decade, 2019-2024, has been very aggressive in developing connectivity between the regions in Indonesia.

The development of air transportation was marked by the opening of many airports for international, national, and pioneer airports, accompanied by the opening of airline routes that had never existed before. However, there are still many remote areas with world-class tourist attractions that have not been reached by air transportation, only using limited modes of land and sea transportation. Tourism development is a series of efforts to integrate tourism resources and incorporate aspects outside of tourism to support tourism development efforts (Swarbrooke, 1999). Air transport infrastructure is a critical variable in enhancing the development of Indonesian tourism, including the Sulawesi Utara Province. One of the blueprints for national economic growth scenarios is constructing 10 New Bali tourist destinations to increase foreign exchange from the presence of foreign and domestic tourists. Stretching tourism will hugely impact regional growth, especially in the small and medium business sectors. Therefore, President Joko Widodo hopes that access to transportation connectivity to tourist destination areas can be improved and prioritized for development.

The leading sector for Indonesia's tourism infrastructure development run by the Ministry of Transportation has built and developed air transportation routes. A tourist destination in Sulawesi Utara that connects the City of Manado to the Bunaken Marine Park and other major tourist destinations through the opening of a satellite or pioneer airport with the support of new flight routes. The opening of this new line targets the low-cost consumer market. All transportation infrastructure developments are integrated with efforts to develop and improve the economy in the region. Tourism strategic planning is carried out collaboratively by the Central Government, Provincial Governments, and City District Governments synergistically and sustainably. Connectivity between areas of tourist destinations with the characteristics of islands with tourist taxis to sea parks, beaches, and water sports is in great demand for tourists. Transportation constraints to get to tourist destinations are a problem for all parties to immediately realize a mode of air transportation which is considered more effective than modes of land and sea transportation.

Accessibility is the primary function behind the successful transformation of tourist destination attractions. To access preferred destination areas, tourists will use any mode of transportation. However, air transportation is the primary mode of bridging international tourism. Air transportation plays a dominant role in connectivity between tourist areas, which usually requires long trips and long travel times when using land or sea transportation modes. The growth rate of international air traffic can thus grow linearly with the growth rate of international tourism. The rise of attractive tour packages and the promotion of economical airline prices with routes that connect many selected destinations will attract more tourists. The aviation and tourism industries are increasing, exceeding the announcement in the strategic tourism development plan launched by the Regional Government of Sulawesi Utara Province (Papatheodorou, 2021).

H2: Air transport connectivity can boost tourist visits.

3. METHODOLOGY

This research combined qualitative and quantitative approaches. In the first stage, the researchers collected and analyzed qualitative data by observing, interviewing, and studying documents. Then collect and analyze quantitative data based on the results of the first phase of data coupled with data quantification through a study in the SWOT analysis for strategic planning. All data is combined to describe the object's related facts, characteristics, or condition (Golkar, 2005).

Informants are assigned to obtain the necessary data, which is limited to the scope of the key parties who are directly involved in the process of preparing a strategic tourism plan, namely, tourism development planners: the Regional Government, which consists of all structural officers of the Regional Planning Agency, and the Culture and Tourism Office. From this group, the researchers wanted to know about the process of preparing strategic planning for tourism in Sulawesi Utara Province in 2017–2021 (Table 1).

Table 1. Research informants

No.	Position	Information collected
1.	Governor of Sulawesi Utara Province	It was related to regional development planning and macro tourism development.
2.	Provincial Regional Secretary	Related to information regarding coordination between regional agencies in the implementation of tourism planning.
3.	Head of Culture and Tourism Office	Related to tourism development planning and determining the priority scale of tourism development in Sulawesi Utara.
4.	Head of the Regional Planning Agency	It is related to the ratification of the Draft Regional Regulation on Tourism.
5.	Chairman of the Infrastructure Commission, Regional People's Representative Council	It is related to ratifying the Regional Draft Regulation and the coordination of tourism planning.
6.	Chairman of the Tourism Association	It was related to the plans of tourism organizations and the needs of each tourism organization.
7.	Tourism entrepreneurs/Investors, 10 people	It is related to the condition of the tourism business world in business development.
8.	Aviation company entrepreneurs/Investors, 10 people	In connection with the dynamics of the airline business in Sulawesi Utara.

Quantitative data were collected through the distribution of questionnaires. It was made using closed questions that were given to officials, authorities, employees, officers of tourism agencies, airport authorities, and airlines, with a total of 96 respondents taken from a population of 115 officials and employees of the three institutions. The sampling technique uses the Slovin technique with the following formula:

$$n = \frac{N}{1 + Ne^2} \quad (1)$$

$$n = \frac{115}{1 + 115(0.05)^2}$$

$$n = 96$$

$$\text{Index formula \%} = \text{Total score} / Y * 100 \quad (2)$$

The questionnaire used for this study uses a 5-point Likert scale of which gives a score with the following explanation:

“Strongly disagree” (STS) was given a score of 1, “Disagree” (TS) was given a score of 2, “Neutral” (N) was given a score of 3, “Agree” (S) was given a score of 4, and “Strongly agree” (SS) was given a score of 5.

Quantitative data analysis is an activity after data from all respondents or other data sources have been collected. Data analysis activities in Creswell (2014) are: grouping data based on variables and types of respondents, tabulating data based on variables from all respondents, presenting data for each variable studied, performing calculations to answer the problem formulation, and performing calculations to test the hypotheses that have been proposed.

This study is a quantitative research with analysis techniques using statistical mode assisted by the SPSS application. There are two kinds of

statistics used for quantitative data analysis, namely descriptive and inferential. The quantitative analysis of this study uses descriptive statistics. Descriptive statistics are statistics that are used to analyze data by describing or describing the data that has been collected as it is without intending to make generally accepted conclusions or generalizations. Descriptive statistical analysis is used when the researcher only wants to describe sample data, not to make conclusions that apply to the population where the sample is taken.

The research process formulates the correlation of strategic planning and air connectivity to tourist arrivals and there is a significant relationship between strategic planning integration and air connectivity to tourist arrivals. This is part of the effort to ensure that strategic planning plays an effective and efficient role in achieving organizational goals, consisting of several interrelated sub-systems, to achieve tourism strategic management goals.

4. RESULTS

4.1. Environmental observation dimensions

As participation in tourism has grown, so too has the number of countries that play host to tourists. Although approximately half of all international arrivals are still received by just ten (principally developed) nations, many new destinations have claimed a place on the international tourism map while numerous more distant, exotic places have, in recent years, enjoyed a rapid increase in tourism. Indeed, throughout the past decade, the East Asia Pacific and Middle East regions have witnessed the highest and most sustained growth in the arrivals globally while, in particular, a number of least developed countries (LDCs) including Cambodia,

Myanmar, Samoa, and Tanzania, have experienced higher than world average growth in tourism (The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development [UNTAD], 2001). Such is the global scale of tourism that The World Trade Organization (WTO) currently publishes annual tourism statistics for around 200 countries.

As for the countries of origin of tourists visiting Sulawesi Utara, they are Singapore, Japan, and Taiwan, which are still the main markets for Sulawesi Utara, at least counting within the next 5 years. The proximity of distance, ease of accessibility, and the presence of emotional ties

(history and culture) influence this growth. Singapore, until now, is still the centre of distributor for foreign tourists for The Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) and European region (England, the Netherlands, Italy, and Germany), as well as a traditional market share of Sulawesi Utara (Perera et al., 2018). The flow of tourists decreased by 22% in 2015 compared to 2014. The decline continued at 28.45%, and a breakthrough occurred in 2016, which almost reached 62%. Then, only in 2018, it increased, namely by 5.14%, and in 2017 it increased by 16.24% (Ryo, 2019).

Table 2. Development of foreign tourist visits to Sulawesi Utara in 2013–2018

No.	Country of origin	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
1.	USA	3.480	1.138	937	774	997	1.201
2.	Canada	6.152	1.167	1.256	305	1.156	1.079
3.	France	3.310	1.287	822	895	899	993
4.	Germany	7.836	2.613	1.592	1.510	1.254	1.020
5.	Italy	3.356	662	63	195	498	691
6.	Netherlands	8.080	7.459	8.168	3.858	3.959	2.351
7.	Switzerland	1.578	1.295	92	210	392	479
8.	Great Britain	4.601	4.489	4.001	1.017	1.417	1.005
9.	Malaysia	23.845	25.551	6.967	165	1.185	3.785
10.	Singapore	18.260	11.210	10.288	2.640	2.384	1.926
11.	Australia	6.353	2.426	2.515	575	981	1.481
12.	Japan	1.222	2.701	109	205	355	855
13.	New Zealand	4.202	141	1.259	355	1.386	1.186
14.	Other	19.999	22.938	12.028	880	3.989	6.979
Total		108.676	85.077	51.028	15.325	20.904	25.040

Source: BPS (2017).

As with foreign tourists, domestic tourist visits have decreased since 2015 and 2016. In 2 years, there has been a decrease of 51.64%; in 2016, the lowest decrease occurred at 93.35%. In 2017, decreased by 87.77%, and in 2018 decreased by 83.60% from the previous year. Indications of an improvement in the national and global economy began to appear from 2016 to 2018 with an increase in the mobility of the community travelling in which the coverage of Sulawesi Utara rose to 12.24%.

Regarding domestic tourists, given the geographic location of Sulawesi Utara, located between the provinces of Sulawesi, Kalimantan, and Maluku, it can be said that there is reason to have the potential to reach the domestic tourist market. Thus, the projected target of domestic tourists in 2019 is 2.355.600, in 2020 is 2.880.770, in 2021 is 3.250.667, and in 2022 is 3.615.998 (assuming the growth of tourist arrivals per year is 15.08%, by the assumptions of the National Tourism Development Master Plan, 2022).

The length of stay for foreign tourists in 2016 was 3.46 days, with an expenditure of US\$95 per day. Meanwhile, the length of stay for domestic tourists

is 1.84 days and costs Rp. 245,000 per day. From the description of product and market conditions as described above, the tourism position of Sulawesi Utara can be mapped as being in the lower middle group parallel to the province of Central Java (BPS, 2017). The challenge for local government in Indonesia is how to realize important pillars in tourism development. The success of tourism development is determined by at least 3 main pillars, namely: success in product development, success in marketing, and success in managing human resources. These three components must be nurtured and developed simultaneously (Wilopo et al., 2020).

4.2. Internal environmental strategic factors

Internal environmental factors that will be identified include potential factors for marine park tourism, tourist attraction, social and cultural attractiveness, facilities and service, convenience, access, and price components (Table 3).

Table 3. Identification of internal environmental factors (Strengths and weakness) (Part 1)

No.	Factors/Aspects	Strength	Weakness
1.	Management and regulatory aspects	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The commitment of government agencies. 2. The existence of educational institutions in the field of tourism (Vocational school and the Tourism Academy). 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Sluggish in adapting to centralized development/authority. 2. Inadequate professional staff in the tourism sector.
2.	Aspects of attraction of tourist attractions in the Bunaken area	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The diversity of tourist objects consists of the Potential of Marine Parks (coral reefs) totalling 262 species, 596 types of fish, islands, white sand beaches, potential mountains, and flora and fauna. 2. Attractions in Manado Bunaken Marine Park are well known to foreign tourists. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The absence of zones in the marine park area (Bunaken Manado). 2. Attractions have not been managed professionally.

Table 3. Identification of internal environmental factors (Strengths and weakness) (Part 2)

No.	Factors/Aspects	Strength	Weakness
3.	Facilities and service aspects	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Availability of adequate accommodation (cottages, inns, hotels), restaurants, and transportation. 2. Entrance tickets and other costs are quite competitive. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Limited promotional activities. 2. Inadequate facilities and infrastructure for roads, bridges, and ports.
4.	The aspect of attraction, cultural, and social	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Able to accommodate the needs environment. 2. People are friendly, sympathetic, sociable, and open. 3. The community is devout in religion and loose in adat. 4. There is social-cultural attractiveness in the local community). 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Travel time to relative location long (disconnected) transportation routes. 2. Lack of tourism information facilities. 3. Relative lack of artistic and cultural attractions in front of tourists. 4. Lack of public concern for the preservation of the natural environment.

4.3. External environmental strategic factors

External environmental factors that will be identified based on field findings include economic, social,

political, and security factors, ecological factors, and aspects of the Bunaken Manado Marine Park tourism object (Table 4).

Table 4. Identification of external environmental factors (Opportunities and threats)

No.	Factor/Aspect	Opportunity	Threat
1.	Economic, social, political, and security aspects	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Globalization of the world economy. 2. Relatively stable local security conditions. 3. Construction of airports and seaports as the main gateways for the entry of tourists. 4. The existence of direct relations with Asia and Europe. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The increase in world oil prices. 2. It was fluctuating dollar value. 3. Social conflicts, politics, terrorists, natural disasters. 4. Negative publicity towards Manado.
2.	Task environment: Stakeholders	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Visits of foreign tourists show an increasing trend. 2. The strong commitment of stakeholders to develop tourism in Manado's Bunaken Marine Park. 3. Forest, river, and sea tourism is very popular with foreign tourists. Ease of taking care of tourism business licensing. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The low level of education, income, and public knowledge about the protected areas of tourism objects. 2. Coordination and cooperation between stakeholders have not been optimally utilized. 3. The low cost of tickets and other fees does not provide opportunities to develop tourism.
3.	Strategic intervention	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ease in managing tourism business licensing. 2. There are opportunities for the scientific development of flora and fauna. 3. Non-governmental organization (NGO) partners already exist/are formed. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The existence of systemic obstacles, such as bureaucratic constraints and inadequate tourism infrastructure. 2. The low interest of banks for tourism investment credit. 3. Marine tourism development in other areas, such as the Manado Bunaken Marine Park.

4.4. Analysis of internal factors

Based on the identification of internal factors, which are the strengths and weaknesses of developing a tourist attraction in Bunaken Manado Marine Park, an internal factor analysis summary (IFAS) table can

be made. The way to compile the IFAS table is by giving weight and rating. The weighting of each factor is based on considerations of "very important" (0.01) to "not important" (0.09), where these factors are likely to have an overall impact on the strategic element in Table 7 (Rangkuti, 1998).

Table 5. Internal strategic factor analysis summary (IFAS) Sulawesi Utara tourism (Part 1)

Internal strategic factors	Quality	Rating	Quality score	Comment
Strength				
1. The commitment of government agencies to promote tourism (Regional Regulation No. 1 of year 2018).	0.05	4	0.20	Take advantage of opportunities
2. There are international airports and seaports type as tourist gates.	0.05	3	0.15	Need to coordinate with tourism business actors
3. The diversity of tourist objects consists of potential marine parks (262 types of coral reefs, 596 species of fish), islands, white sand beaches, potential mountains, flora, and fauna.	0.05	4	0.20	It is necessary to preserve the natural potential in the region
4. The tourist attraction of the Bunaken Manado Marine Park is well known to foreign tourists.	0.05	4	0.20	Maintain image
5. Availability of accommodation (cottages, inns, hotels), restaurants, and adequate means of transportation.	0.05	4	0.20	Needs improvement
6. Entrance fees and other costs are quite competitive.	0.05	4	0.20	Needs improvement
7. Able to accommodate environmental needs.	0.06	4	0.24	Improved coaching
8. People are friendly, sympathetic, easy to get along with, and open.	0.05	4	0.20	Community development
9. The community is religiously devout and loose in customs.	0.04	4	0.16	Counseling tolerance attitude
10. The social-cultural attraction of the local community.	0.05	3	0.15	Preservation and development of local culture

Table 5. Internal strategic factor analysis summary (IFAS) Sulawesi Utara tourism (Part 2)

<i>Internal strategic factors</i>	<i>Quality</i>	<i>Rating</i>	<i>Quality score</i>	<i>Comment</i>
Weakness				
1. Slow in adjusting to centralized development/authority.	0.05	2	0.05	Need coordination between related agencies
2. The connectivity of transportation and infrastructure to tourist objects is inadequate.	0.06	2	0.12	There needs to be coordination of tourist routes
3. There is no division of zones in the Manado Bunaken Marine Park area.	0.06	1	0.12	It needs attention from the government
4. Tourism objects have not been managed professionally.	0.05	2	0.05	Need coaching
5. We have limited promotional activities.	0.05	1	0.10	Needs to be improved
6. Inadequate facilities and infrastructure for roads, bridges, and ports.	0.04	1	0.04	Needs to be improved
7. The travel time to the location is relatively long.	0.06	1	0.12	Need alternative transportation facilities and infrastructure to the location
8. Lack of tourism information facilities.	0.04	1	0.04	There need to be pockets of tourism information
9. Relatively lack artistic and cultural attractions in front of tourists.	0.06	1	0.06	Art group creativity is needed
10. Lack of public concern for the preservation of the natural environment.	0.03	1	0.03	An environmental awareness movement is needed
Total score	100		2.61	

Source: Focus Group Discussion (FGD), 2020.

Table 6. Scoring internal strategic factor analysis summary (IFAS) Sulawesi Utara tourism

<i>Score description</i>			<i>Rating description</i>	
0.1	Very important	The impact is huge	Very strong	4
			Strong enough	3
0.05	Quite important	Impact enough	Less strong	2
			Not strong	1
0.00	Not important	Small impact	Very weak	1
			Weak enough	2
			Less weak	3
			Not weak	4

4.5. Analysis of external factors

The result of the calculation in Table 7 (external factor analysis summary — EFAS) below is after multiplying the weight values by rating values to

obtain the weighting scores for each factor whose values vary from 4.0 (outstanding) to 1.0 (poor), then the weighting scores are added up to obtain the total weighting score.

Table 7. External strategic factor analysis summary (EFAS) development of Sulawesi Utara tourism objects (Part 1)

<i>External strategic factors</i>	<i>Quality</i>	<i>Rating</i>	<i>Quality ratings</i>	<i>Comment</i>
Opportunity				
1. Globalization of the world economy.	0.03	3	0.09	Need to be proactive
2. Relatively stable regional security conditions.	0.07	4	0.21	Increase security
3. There are educational institutions in the field of tourism (vocational schools and tourism academies).	0.05	4	0.20	Improving human tourism resources
4. There is a direct relationship between Asia and Europe.	0.05	4	0.20	Increase cooperation
5. Visits of foreign tourists show an increasing trend.	0.04	4	0.08	Catch the momentum
6. The strong commitment of stakeholders to develop marine park tourism in Kepulauan Togean.	0.04	2	0.08	Make one-stop service effective, increase promotions
7. Forest, river, and sea tourism is highly favoured by foreign tourists.	0.05	3	0.15	Needs to be promoted
8. Ease in managing tourism business licensing.	0.07	4	0.21	There need to be regulations that facilitate licensing
9. There are opportunities for the scientific development of flora and fauna.	0.05	3	0.15	Need to be preserved
10. Partner NGOs already exist/have formed.	0.06	3	0.18	Catch the momentum

Table 7. External strategic factor analysis summary (EFAS) development of Sulawesi Utara tourism objects (Part 2)

<i>External strategic factors</i>	<i>Quality</i>	<i>Rating</i>	<i>Quality ratings</i>	<i>Comment</i>
Threat				
1. Increasing world oil prices.	0.05	1	0.05	Efficiency
2. The fluctuating value of the dollar.	0.05	2	0.10	Increased use of local products
3. Accumulation of tourism human resources if tourism jobs are not absorbed.	0.05	1	0.05	Increase tourism investment
4. Negative publicity toward Sulawesi Utara.	0.05	1	0.05	Advertising increase
5. The low level of education, income, and knowledge of the community about the protected area of Manado's Bunaken Marine Park.	0.06	2	0.12	Efforts are needed to develop a regional image
6. Coordination and cooperation between stakeholders have not been utilized optimally.	0.05	2	0.10	Coaching and counselling
7. The low cost of tickets and other costs does not provide opportunities to develop tourism.	0.04	2	0.08	Synergy, coordination, and cooperation are needed
8. There are systemic obstacles, such as bureaucratic constraints, inadequate tourism infrastructure.	0.05	2	0.10	Efficiency
9. The low interest of banks for tourism investment credit.	0.04	2	0.08	Efforts are needed to improve coordination between related agencies in the region
10. Development of marine tourism in other areas.	0.05	2	0.10	Looking for sources of financing in the form of soft loans
Total score	1.00		2.48	

Source: FGD.

Table 8. Scoring external strategic factor analysis summary (EFAS) development of Sulawesi Utara tourism objects

<i>Score description</i>			<i>Rating description</i>	
0.1	Very important	The impact is huge	Very strong	4
			Strong enough	3
0.05	Quite important	Impact enough	Less strong	2
			Not strong	1
0.00	Not important	Small impact	Very weak	1
			Weak enough	2
			Less weak	3
			Not weak	4

Based on the results of the internal-external analysis matrix with a total score of IFAS = 2.61 and EFAS = 2.48, it identifies that Sulawesi Utara tourism has quite an open opportunity as an alternative to world tourism destinations and is vital as a mainstay of national tourism destinations with a prerequisite for progressive development. Infrastructure with central funding and regional tasks to prepare land support facilities, assistance funds, and human resources as operators of the tourism industry, as well as other stakeholders to be developed to support the future economic development of Sulawesi Utara. For this reason, the primary strategy is suitable for developing tourism in Sulawesi Utara through several strategic policies, which will be discussed further in the following sub-section.

4.6. Dimensions of determining the mission of the organization

The Sulawesi Utara tourism development Strategic Plan document regarding the Vision, Mission and Development Targets of Sulawesi Utara is described further (Provinsi Sulawesi Utara, 2022).

The vision for developing the 2014-2018 Sulawesi Utara Culture and Tourism Office is: "The realization of a cultured Sulawesi Utara as a competitive tourism destination and able to improve the welfare of the people towards the gateway to Indonesia in the Asia Pacific region" (Lasso & Dahles, 2018).

One of the critical domains of tourism strategic planning decisions is the formulation of missions, goals, and objectives. That is why it needs severe scientific discussion. Related experts and upper-echelon officials do the formulation. And, as soon as the competent authority approves it, it can be used as a standard legal reference for implementing tourism development. It is necessary to accelerate tourism development because the demand and trend of modern tourism are growing; it is an opportunity. But on the other hand, there is no planning that can solve existing problems properly such as transportation problems, so the optimization of tourism development has not been achieved. Based on empirical observations in this study, the authors found that there are obstacles in the strategic planning process for tourism in Sulawesi Utara as follows.

4.6.1. Lack of agreement on tourism planning principles

Strategic planning requires an agreed commitment to the planning principles to be followed. The agreement was primarily a willingness to establish and maintain planning discipline, be involved in all allotted time, talk and discuss plans every day, and then focus on planning issues.

4.6.2. The cost of making a tourism development plan is relatively high

Besides bringing the benefits of strategic planning, it does not have limitations, constraints, or obstacles. Naturally, it is recognized that the strategic planning process requires a lot of time and money. In general, the consideration is that the available funds are more urgent to be used for projects in more urgent development sectors, such as the health and education sectors, rather than being used to compile strategic planning.

4.6.3. The number of parties involved and the complexity of the network

The complexity of tourism development results from the extent of the existing problems and the large number of parties involved, accompanied by the independence of each stakeholder in determining the objectives and priorities of the activities they carry out. In a situation like this, coordination becomes an urgent need, and in turn, every party involved is required to work together without neglecting their respective duties and functions.

The parties that must be involved in tourism planning consist of both central and regional governments; local communities; NGOs; tourism organizations such as Association of the Indonesian Tours and Travel Agencies (ASITA), Indonesian Hotel and Restaurant Association (PHRI), and Indonesian Translators Association (HPI); tourism education institutions; tourism business operators; and tourism consultants. Each party has goals that its organization wants to achieve, and it is not uncommon for conflicts of interest to occur between them. Tourism nongovernmental organizations are interested in green environmental protection and sustainable tourism planning, or efforts to protect the heritage of historical buildings. On the other hand, the business world tends to develop tourism businesses with a profit prospect approach only.

4.7. Dimensions of strategy determination

The strategy for realizing tourism development in Sulawesi Utara was formulated after the determination of the mission, one of which is to develop a competitive tourism industry. One of the priority tourism development programs in Sulawesi Utara Province is the development of product diversification which includes the development of integrated marine park ecotourism as the leading tourism object of Sulawesi Utara.

Based on field observations, implementing the integrated marine park ecotourism (ETLT) area has not yet implied the realization of this development strategy. The development is still general so up to now, the handling and management of the ETLT area in a unique and integrated manner have not been implemented. One indicator of

the successful implementation of strategic objectives is the existence of changes in the objects that have been determined. If this is not yet visible, then the active participation of all key officials is needed to make it happen.

4.8. Targeting dimensions

Based on the results of observations and study documentation of the strategic planning for tourism development, seen from the organizational goals, it contributes to the public interest, especially the tourism community of Sulawesi Utara. Although some targets have not been achieved and others have been realized, these conditions are still not ideal. However, the strategic planning for tourism development, seen from the elements of the organizational targets set by the Sulawesi Utara Culture and Tourism Office, shows a vital role as a reference or direction for tourism development. The organizational goals are part of the road map that the Sulawesi Utara Provincial Government's tourism development sector aims to aim at. The organizational goals are periodically updated according to external needs and dynamics in the Medium Term Development Plan framework.

The organizational goals of the Sulawesi Utara Culture and Tourism Office are a necessity, a planning instrument that must exist, and organizational goals are needed because they function as organizational legitimacy, as a direction for organizational development, and as a criterion for measuring organizational performance and reducing uncertainty.

4.9. Air connectivity and tourist access

Air connectivity is the most crucial point to spur the development of Indonesian tourism, including the Sulawesi Utara region because it is a prime mover of microeconomic and scattered tourist destinations. This is because almost 90% of foreign tourists visiting Indonesia use air transportation modes (Sadya, 2022). Manado's Sam Ratulangi Airport, as the only international airport in Sulawesi Utara Province, plays a strategic role in supporting the development of the tourism sector, which directly functions as an infrastructure for the arrival and departure of local, regional, and international tourists. Connecting Sam Ratulangi Airport in Manado, Sulawesi Utara, to various international airports can encourage an increase in regular tourist arrivals. The development of air transport and tourism modes is mutually beneficial. Air transportation can take tourists faster and cover even very long distances.

Based on data from the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy of the Republic of Indonesia, the trend of foreign tourist visits in the last 5 years at the entrance to Sam Ratulangi International Airport, Sulawesi Utara could be seen in Table 9:

Table 9. Development of international tourists in Indonesia 2014–2018

Entrance	Province	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
Gate 1 to 18 (Sam Ratulangi)	Sulawesi Utara	21,795	29,715	20,220	20,074	19,111
Main		5,788,959	5,898,860	6,575,423	7,207,885	7,567,381
Another main entrance		445,538	424,870	427,521	441,846	477,081
Total		6,234,497	6,323,730	7,002,944	7,649,731	8,044,462

Source: Pusdatin Kemenparekrif and BPS (2018).

Based on existing data, the trend of foreign tourist visits to Bumi Nyiur Melambai (the nickname for Sulawesi Utara) entering Sam Ratulangi International Airport is relatively fluctuating. It has even tended to decline in the last 3 years. The surge occurred in 2015 when Sulawesi Utara hosted several international events in the previous two years, namely the World Ocean Conference (WOC)

and the Coral Triangle Initiative (CTI) Summit, and the 2015 Sail Bunaken.

Based on the target and realization, data on tourist visits in Sulawesi Utara Province obtained through the Culture and Tourism Office shows a slightly different figure, because the data comes not only from the airport entrance but also from land and sea (Table 10).

Table 10. Target and realization of tourism development in Sulawesi Utara

Year	International tourists			Indonesian tourists		
	Target	Realization	Deviation	Target	Realization	Deviation
2014	30.000	32.760	+2.760	400.000	409.065	+9.065
2015	40.000	51.977	+11.977	500.000	881.431	+331.431
2016	40.000	30.996	-9.004	500.000	366.826	-133.174
2017	41.000	41.904	+904	550.000	510.493	-39.507
2018	41.000	50.008	+9.008	600.000	521.493	-78.507
Total	194.000	207.645	+13.645	2.550.000	2.689.308	+90.313

Source: Department of Culture and Tourism of Sulawesi Utara Province (2018).

5. DISCUSSION

The description of the object of this research presents an overview of the importance of developing tourism in Sulawesi Utara through the integration of strategic planning and air connectivity so that tourist visits can increase significantly. This holistic general description is intended to obtain a complete concept map of the actual conditions of tourism development in Sulawesi Utara. Tourism as an integral development sub-sector of the Sulawesi Utara regional government is multi-sectoral. The development characteristics of Sulawesi Utara influence its characteristics and development. Tourism is more inclusive by optimally absorbing local infrastructure and superstructure utilization. Strategic planning includes four dimensions, namely environmental scanning, organizational mission determination, strategy determination, and target determination, then used as a guide for this research (Mercer, 1991). The four dimensions, based on the results of the study that have been carried out, are described above. Strategic planning analysis has an important role in tourism development, this happens for two reasons, namely providing scientific and accurate information to policymakers and solving community problems while aiming to improve the quality of macro and micro tourism policies made by the provincial government of Sulawesi Utara.

Air transportation connectivity is provided by the Ministry of Transportation, in this case, the operator, PT Angkasa Pura II encourages the regional tourism industry to grow and develop rapidly (AngkasaPura, 2016). So, the operator has two missions, one for public air transportation and the other for tourism destination capacity building. So far, the relationship between tourism and state income is explained through research results that show a significant contribution from air connectivity to the development of tourist destinations, as said by Vanegas and Croes (2003) and Durbarry (2004).

Foreign tourist visits to Sulawesi Utara for the January 2019–July 2019 period reached 73,137 people. This realization increased by 3% compared to 71,000 tourists in the same period the previous year (BPS, 2022). The positive growth prospects for tourism are strengthened by the Likupang special economic zone (LSEZ) as a super-priority tourist destination. The Regional

Government is targeting there will be 150,000 in 2019, and in 2020, it is targeting 200,000 foreign tourists visiting. The positive growth in foreign tourist arrivals has encouraged domestic and foreign airlines to open flight routes to Manado and Sulawesi Utara. Direct flight services from several cities in Eastern Indonesia to Manado and other cities in Sulawesi Utara will help tourism destinations grow (Erick, 2019).

Even though the mode of air transportation plays a vital role in assisting tourist arrivals and institutionally handling air transportation, its primary duties and functions are under the Ministry of Transportation (Wahyunadi et al., 2021). Excellent and smooth air accessibility can be realized through inter-institutional cooperation. In this case, the Ministry of Tourism and the Ministry of Transportation need to be closely linked with the enthusiasm to solve problems in the field that hinder tourism development in Sulawesi Utara, mainly traffic right and flight route licensing, airport capacity, and seats capacity airlines. These constraining factors contain a common thread for the need to develop the capacity of the air transportation sector in which there are elements of airport infrastructure, airport authorities, and airlines.

The infrastructure that tourists need for the tourist destination of choice is the urgency for the availability of a decent airport and an open route to the next tourist destination. PT Angkasa Pura I and II run airport management in Indonesia as airport service operators. The critical role of the airport authority is as a reference for airlines in realizing the opening of flight routes. This can only happen if airport management can guarantee the availability of time slots in the airport, including the air segment and ground segment as essential assets for airlines in opening new routes as short-term as well as long-term business considerations.

An essential indicator of the progress of aviation infrastructure is the development of an airport, terminal expansion, and runway extension, which will significantly impact tourist visits. According to data released by The World Tourism Organization (UNWTO, 2014) on examples that occurred in Japan, the construction of airports and their supporting infrastructure has increased tourist visits by 50–60% in the two years post-construction. A very significant achievement, as

an illustration, is Narita International Airport in Tokyo. The picture is shown by the progress of airport management by the authorities in Japan and several other countries can inspire and increase the confidence of managers and stakeholders in Sulawesi Utara to learn about this phenomenon so that tourist visits to Sulawesi Utara overgrow and they can continue their visits. Next to several other tourist destinations in Indonesia (Cannone & Ughetto, 2014; Ryall, 2016).

The results of the overall interpretation of the qualitative analysis and quantification of the SWOT analysis data were then tested by the researchers by distributing questionnaires to employees/officials/authorities of the Sulawesi Utara Tourism Office, Airport Authority, and aviation companies (Table A.1 in the Appendix).

The overall description above shows that the air flight connectivity policy as an integral part of the strategic tourism planning in Sulawesi Utara Province has not been effective. As a result, the program's goal of becoming a tourism province has not been achieved. This argument is based on qualitative descriptions, which were tested quantitatively through questionnaires with respondents from officials, officers, employees, the Department of Tourism of Sulawesi Utara, PT Angkasa Pura, and aviation companies.

6. CONCLUSION

Strategic planning as one of the basic management functions is an alternative to the implementation of tourism development for the purpose of sustainable development and economic income from tourism activities. As a model for the development of the New Bali tourist destination, North Sulawesi is one of the tourism provinces that has great potential after being analyzed using a SWOT analysis which includes environmental monitoring, mission setting, strategy and goals for the province of Sulawesi Utara. There is an urgency for tourism development in Sulawesi Utara, which is carried out through strategic planning by integrating aspects of air transport connectivity. Thus, strategic planning analysis is needed to provide scientific information and policy decision making effectively.

Tourist destinations are supported by the flow of tourist arrivals, most of whom use air transportation. Ideally, flight connectivity to Manado's Sam Ratulangi Airport, with the availability and opening of new routes, can make it easier for tourists to get to tourist destinations. However, the existing condition of air transportation accessibility for tourist visits is not yet wide open. The integration of air connectivity and strategic

planning for tourism development as a driving factor for the development of tourist destinations has also not achieved its goals. The findings show formulation of tourism planning in Sulawesi Utara Province tends to be partial. Planning is done without taking into account the essential variables. For example, the development of air transport infrastructure opens access to tourist destinations difficult to reach by land and sea transportation modes. Strategic planning tends only to fulfil procedural aspects, not intensely involving the professional role of tourism planning experts and stakeholders, so tourism development tends to be unfocused and unsustainable.

The role of air connectivity in opening archipelagic tourist destination routes needs to be formulated in strategic tourism planning, and it is urgent to implement it immediately. With the opening of several pioneering airports, most tourists arriving in Sulawesi Utara using air transportation can take new routes, which so far have only been through Manado's Sam Ratulangi Airport as the only international airport in Sulawesi Utara. The integration of strategic planning that gives priority to the development of air connectivity will be optimal if the strategic planning for tourism development is carried out consistently, namely: 1) environmental scanning is carried out thoroughly and periodically to obtain accurate and up-to-date tourism information in the context of forecasting or predict the future; 2) local government should increase coordination and synergy with interested parties, namely various related government agencies, the private sector, and the community; 3) creating a pattern for developing tourism human resources in the government sector (planners), tourism actors and society by the scope of work/business activities in various forms and techniques of extension, education, and training. A limitation of the study is based on the fact that the sample on which we tested our hypothesis was composed of 250 tourism agency officials, 150 airport authorities, and 325 airline company respondents. Thus, future studies suggested analyzing a broader sample.

This paper is important for future research because the new findings from this research will open up as many air transportation routes as possible to various tourist destinations in Sulawesi Utara so that it will encourage more tourists to visit them. This research contributes to the literature on the development of tourist destinations and ways to stimulate tourists who only make Bali the final destination in their travels in Indonesia and a source of support for low-cost airline business people to develop various tourist routes in Sulawesi Utara.

REFERENCES

1. Abuamoud, I., Ibrahim, A., & Al-Tabini, R. (2022). Economic impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the tourism industry [Special issue]. *Corporate & Business Strategy Review*, 3(2), 321-327. <https://doi.org/10.22495/cbsrv3i2siart13>
2. Al-Janabi, A. S. H., Mhaibes, H. A., & Hussein, S. A. (2023). The role of learning organizations in crisis management strategy: A case study. *Corporate & Business Strategy Review*, 4(1), 8-21. <https://doi.org/10.22495/cbsrv4i1art1>
3. Andraz, J. M., Norte, N. M., & Gonçalves, H. S. (2015). Effects of tourism on regional asymmetries: Empirical evidence for Portugal. *Tourism Management*, 50, 257-267. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2015.03.004>
4. AngkasaPura. (2016). *Building national pride through the development of airport infrastructure*. https://ap1.co.id/contents/file/916-SR_Angkasa_Pura_I_Tahun_2016_LR.pdf

5. Anwar, A. (2019). Law of Substance and Consistency of Regional Regulation Number 3 of 2006 Concerning Community Development Activities in Karimah. *International Journal of Islamic Khazanah*, 9(1), 9-22. <https://journal.uinsgd.ac.id/index.php/ijik/article/view/9016>
6. Asadi, R. (2011). Strategies for development of Iran cultural tourism. *Australian Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences*, 5(8), 1021-1034. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/215872348_Strategies_for_Development_of_Iran_Cultural_Tourism
7. Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Sulawesi Utara. (n.d.). *Konsep dan definisi statistik kunjungan wisatawan mancanegara*. <https://sulut.bps.go.id/subject/16/pariwisata.html>
8. Biro Pusat Statistik (BPS). (2017). *Data of countries visit Indonesia from 2000 to 2017*. <https://www.bps.go.id/indicator/16/1821/1/number-of-foreign-tourist-visits-to-indonesia-by-nationality.html>
9. Biro Pusat Statistik (BPS). (2022). *Data of countries visit Indonesia from 2022 to 2000*. <https://www.bps.go.id/indicator/16/1821/1/number-of-foreign-tourist-visits-to-indonesia-by-nationality.html>
10. Bourgeois, L. J., III. (1980). Strategy and environment: A conceptual integration. *Academy of Management Review*, 5(1), 25-39. <https://doi.org/10.2307/257802>
11. Bryson, J. M. (2018). *Strategic planning for public and nonprofit organizations: A guide to strengthening and sustaining organizational achievement*. John Wiley & Sons.
12. Bryson, J. M., & Roering, W. D. (1987). Applying private-sector strategic planning in the public sector. *Journal of the American Planning Association*, 53(1), 9-22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01944368708976631>
13. Bulatović, I., & Tripković-Marković, A. (2015). Strategic management of tourism in the national parks: Case: National Park Skadar Lake. *Turizam*, 19(3), 127-138. <https://doi.org/10.5937/Turizam1503127B>
14. Camillus, J. C., & Datta, D. K. (1991). Managing strategic issues in a turbulent environment. *Long Range Planning*, 24(2), 67-74. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0024-6301\(91\)90081-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/0024-6301(91)90081-X)
15. Cannone, G., & Ughetto, E. (2014). Funding innovation at regional level: An analysis of a public policy intervention in the Piedmont Region. *Regional Studies*, 48(2), 270-283. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00343404.2011.653338>
16. Choy, D. J. L. (1991). Tourism planning: The case for 'market failure'. *Tourism Management*, 12(4), 313-330. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0261-5177\(91\)90044-T](https://doi.org/10.1016/0261-5177(91)90044-T)
17. Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE Publication, Inc.
18. Department of Culture and Tourism of Sulawesi Utara Province. (2018). *Target and realization of tourism development in Sulawesi Utara*. https://satudata.sulutprov.go.id/kategori_data/9
19. Durbarray, R. (2004). Tourism and economic growth: The case of Mauritius. *Tourism Economics*, 10(4), 389-401. <https://doi.org/10.5367/0000000042430962>
20. Dwyer, L., & Forsyth, P. (2008). Economic measures of tourism yield: What markets to target? *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 10(2), 155-168. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jtr.648>
21. Erick, A. (2019, September 27). *Tujuh direct flight memicu pariwisata Sulawesi Utara*. *Maritim*. <https://tabloidmaritim.com/2019/09/27/tujuh-direct-flight-memicu-pariwisata-sulawesi-utara/>
22. Gandara, M. (2020). Kewenangan atribusi, delegasi dan mandat. *Khazanah Hukum*, 2(3), 92-99. <https://doi.org/10.15575/kh.v2i3.8187>
23. Golkar, K. (2005). Improving SWOT analysis technique for application in urban design. *Soffeh Journal*, 11(41).
24. Hall, C. M. (2011). Policy learning and policy failure in sustainable tourism governance: From first- and second-order to third-order change? *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 19(4-5), 649-671. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2011.555555>
25. Kambey, H. J. (2016). Tourist object in Tomohon city as a basic consideration for tourism destination development in highland ecosystem. *Journal of Indonesian Tourism and Development Studies*, 4(1), 13-18. <https://doi.org/10.21776/ub.jitode.2016.004.01.03>
26. Ladeiras, A., Mota, A., & Costa, J. (2010). Strategic tourism planning in practice: The case of the Open Academy of Tourism. *Worldwide Hospitality and Tourism Themes*, 2(4), 357-363. <https://doi.org/10.1108/17554211011074010>
27. Lasso, A., & Dahles, H. (2018). Are tourism livelihoods sustainable? Tourism development and economic transformation on Komodo Island, Indonesia. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 23(5), 473-485. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2018.1467939>
28. Mercer, J. L. (1991). *Strategic planning for public managers*. ABC-CLIO.
29. Nugroho, I., Negara, P. D., & Yuniar, H. R. (2018). The planning and the development of the ecotourism and tourism village in Indonesia: A policy review. *Journal of Socioeconomics and Development*, 1(1), 43-51. <https://doi.org/10.31328/jsed.v1i1.532>
30. Ollivaud, P., & Haxton, P. (2019). *Making the most of tourism in Indonesia to promote sustainable regional development* (Economics Department Working Paper No. 1535). Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). [https://one.oecd.org/document/ECO/WKP\(2019\)4/En/pdf](https://one.oecd.org/document/ECO/WKP(2019)4/En/pdf)
31. Pambudi, A. L., Daryanto, A., & Hartoyo, S. (2014). Development strategy of natural tourism in Pancar Mountain Natural Park. *Jurnal Manajemen Dan Kewirausahaan*, 16(1), 27-34. <https://doi.org/10.9744/jmk.16.1.27-34>
32. Papatheodorou, A. (2021). A review of research into air transport and tourism: Launching the Annals of Tourism Research Curated Collection on Air Transport and Tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 87, Article 103151. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2021.103151>
33. Perera, V., Rotinsulu, W., Tasirin, J., & Zandvliet, D. (2018). Indonesian adventures: Developing an ecology of place on Sulawesi Utara. In G. Reis & J. Scott (Eds.), *International perspectives on the theory and practice of environmental education: A reader* (pp. 99-114). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-67732-3_8
34. Popescu, R. I., & Corboş, R. A. (2011). Vienna's branding campaign—strategic option for developing Austria's capital in a top tourism destination. *Theoretical and Empirical Researches in Urban Management*, 6(3), 43-60. <http://um.ase.ro/no63/4.pdf>
35. Provinsi Sulawesi Utara. (2022). *Renstra strategis 2021-2026*. https://diskominfo.sulutprov.go.id/l-content/uploads/ren_keu_2021/DKIPS_RENSTRAS_STRATEGIS_2021-2026.pdf
36. Puhakka, R., & Saarinen, J. (2013). New role of tourism in national park planning in Finland. *The Journal of Environment & Development*, 22(4), 411-434. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1070496513502966>
37. Pusdatin Kemenparekraf & BPS. (2018). *Development of international tourists in Indonesia 2014-2018, according to entrance (Sulawesi Utara)*. <https://kemenparekraf.go.id/statistik-wisatawan-mancanegara>

38. Rangkuti, F. (1998). *Analisis SWOT teknik membedah kasus bisnis*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
39. Ryall, J. (2016, September 29). Japan's Narita airport plans third runway amid tourist surge. *South China Morning Post*. <https://www.scmp.com/news/asia/east-asia/article/2023785/>
40. Ryo, N. (2019, January 11). Wisman yang berkunjung ke sulut selama 2018 sebanyak 124.830 orang, turis China masih mendominasi. *TribunManado*. <https://manado.tribunnews.com/2019/01/11/wisman-yang-berkunjung-ke-sulut-selama-2018-sebanyak-124830-orang-turis-china-masih-mendominasi>
41. Sadya, S. (2022, October 3). Ada 510.246 kunjungan wisman ke Indonesia pada Agustus 2022. *Data Indonesia*. <https://dataindonesia.id/sektor-riil/detail/ada-510246-kunjungan-wisman-ke-indonesia-pada-agustus-2022>
42. Sarfaraz, A. H., Shariatmadari, M., Hedayat, P., & Vadoudi, K. (2013). Strategy formulating for semi-governmental companies, case study: Railway transportation in QODS NIROO. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 99, 1082–1092. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.10.582>
43. Smith, J., Satar, R., Wiryawan, A., & Boothman, T. (2016). *Indonesian infrastructure: Stable foundations for growth*. PwC. <https://www.pwc.com/id/en/cpi/asset/new-version/indonesian-infrastructure-stable-foundations-for-growth.pdf>
44. Swarbrooke, J. (1999). *Sustainable tourism management*. Cabi. <https://doi.org/10.1079/9780851993140.0000>
45. The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD). (2001). *Tourism and development in the least developed countries*. <https://unctad.org/topic/least-developed-countries/list>
46. The World Tourism Organization (UNWTO). (2014). *Asia and the Pacific*. <https://www.unwto.org/asia/regional-department-for-asia-and-the-pacific>
47. Tunggono, V. (2016, February 5). Indonesia will have 10 Bali-like destinations in the next four years. *brilio.net*. <https://en.brilio.net/news/indonesia-will-have-10-new-bali-like-destinations-in-the-next-4-years-10-new-bali-like-destinations-.html>
48. Vanegas, M., Sr., & Croes, R. R. (2003). Growth, development and tourism in a small economy: Evidence from Aruba. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 5(5), 315–330. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jtr.441>
49. Wahyunadi, W., Afifi, M., & Firmansyah, M. F. M. (2021). Institutional synergy model in development tourism village in East Lombok Regency. *Khazanah Sosial*, 3(3), 177–185. <https://doi.org/10.15575/ks.v3i3.20303>
50. Wilopo, Iqbal, M., Alfisyahr, R., & Irawan, A. (2020). Strategic issues of tourism destination in Indonesia: Are they market ready? *International Journal of Entrepreneurship*, 24(2), 1–16. <https://www.abacademies.org/articles/Strategic-Issues-of-Tourism-Destination-In-Indonesia-Are-They-Market-Ready.pdf>
51. Zajac, G. (2016). The role of air transport in the development of international tourism. *Journal of International Trade, Logistics and Law*, 2(1), 1–8. <https://core.ac.uk/download/230151291.pdf>

APPENDIX

Table A.1. Questionnaire on strategic planning and air connectivity for tourism in Sulawesi Utara Province

No.	Question	No. of respondents	STS (1)	TS (2)	N (3)	S (4)	SS (5)
Environmental observation							
1	Does the Head of the Tourism Office give directions in environmental observation?	96	6	21	23	24	22
Determining the mission of the organization							
2	Do officials in determining the organisation's mission involve employee forums and related parties?	96	36	32	15	8	5
Strategy and target determination							
3	Do officials formulate strategy and target determination with in-depth analysis and involve a team of experts?	96	2	16	40	32	6
Air connectivity and tourist access							
4	Do central and regional officials have a strong commitment and adequate resources to realizing air connectivity and tourist access?	96	21	39	21	9	6
Airport and air navigation management							
5	Is the authority of PT Angkasa Pura in managing airports and air navigation run professionally with world-class standards?	96	19	38	13	11	15
Total			84	146	112	84	54

Respondents who answered:	
Strongly agree (SS 5)	54 × 5 = 270
Agree (S 4)	84 × 4 = 336
Neutral (N 3)	112 × 3 = 336
Disagree (TS 2)	146 × 2 = 292
Strongly disagree (STS 1)	84 × 1 = 84
Total score	1.318

The total highest score for items SS is 5 × (96 × 5 aspects) = 2400	
Strategic planning 1318 × 100%	= 54.91%
Total score: 2400	